

The Journal of Neuroscience

<https://jneurosci.msubmit.net>

JN-RM-1566-18R1

Retrospective Cues Mitigate Information Loss in Human Cortex During
Working Memory Storage

Edward Ester, Florida Atlantic University
Asal Nouri, Florida Atlantic University
Laura Rodriguez, Florida Atlantic University

Commercial Interest:

Retrospective cues mitigate information loss in human cortex during working memory storage.

Edward F. Ester^{1,3}, Asal Nouri^{1,3*}, Laura Rodriguez^{1*}

¹*Department of Psychology, Florida Atlantic University*

²*Center for Complex Systems and Brain Sciences, Florida Atlantic University*

³*FAU Brain Institute, Florida Atlantic University*

Correspondence:

Edward Ester
Department of Psychology
Florida Atlantic University
BS-12, RM-101
777 Glades Rd.
Boca Raton, FL., 33431
eester@fau.edu

Author Contributions: E.F.E. conceived and designed the experiment, L.R. and A.N., and E.F.E. collected and analyzed the data. E.F.E. wrote the paper. * - these authors contributed equally to the project and are listed alphabetically.

Data and Software Availability: All data and analytical software associated with this project are publicly available on the Open Sciences Framework: <https://osf.io/m4c2p/>

Funding: This work was supported by a State University System of Florida startup grant to E.F.E. The authors declare no competing financial interests.

Acknowledgements: The authors thank Tommy Sprague for helpful comments on an earlier version of this manuscript.

Text Limits:

Abstract: 226/250

Significance Statement: 116/120

Introduction: 565/650

Discussion: 1554/1500

Figures/Tables: 9/0

41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59

Abstract

Working memory (WM) enables the flexible representation of information over short intervals. It is well-established that WM performance can be enhanced by a retrospective cue presented during storage, yet the neural mechanisms responsible for this benefit are unclear. Here, we tested several explanations for retro-cue benefits by quantifying changes in spatial WM representations reconstructed from alpha-band (8-12 Hz) EEG activity recorded from human participants (both sexes) before and after presentation of a retrospective cue. This allowed us to track cue-related changes in WM representations with high temporal resolution (tens of milliseconds). Participants encoded the locations of two colored discs for subsequent report. During neutral trials an uninformative cue instructed participants to remember the locations of both discs across a blank delay, and we observed a monotonic decrease in the fidelity of reconstructed spatial WM representations with time. During valid trials a 100% reliable cue indicated the color of the disc participants would be probed to report. Critically, valid cues were presented immediately after termination of the encoding display (“valid early”, or VE trials) or midway through the delay period (“valid late” or VL trials). During VE trials the gradual loss of location-specific information observed during neutral trials was eliminated, while during VL trials it was partially reversed. Our findings suggest that retro-cues engage several different mechanisms that together serve to mitigate information loss during WM storage.

60
61
62
63
64
65
66
67
68
69
70

Significance Statement

Working memory (WM) performance can be improved by a cue presented during storage. This effect, termed a retrospective cue benefit, has been used to explore the limitations of attentional prioritization in WM. However, the mechanisms responsible for retrospective cue benefits are unclear. Here we tested several explanations for retrospective cue benefits by examining how they influence WM representations reconstructed from human EEG activity. This approach allowed us to visualize, quantify, and track the effects of retrospective cues with high temporal resolution (on the order of tens of milliseconds). We show that under different circumstances retrospective cues can both eliminate and even partially reverse information loss during WM storage, suggesting that retrospective cue benefits have manifold origins.

71 Visual working memory (WM) enables the representation and manipulation of
72 information no longer in the sensorium. This system is an integral component of many higher-
73 order cognitive abilities (e.g., Cowan et al. 2000), yet it has a sharply limited representational
74 capacity (e.g., Luck & Vogel, 2013; Ma et al. 2014). Thus, mechanisms of selective attention are
75 needed to control access to WM (e.g., Vogel et al. 2005) and to prioritize existing WM
76 representations for behavioral output (e.g., Myers et al. 2017). Attentional prioritization in WM
77 has been extensively studied using retrospective cues (see Souza & Oberauer, 2016 and Myers et
78 al. 2017 for recent comprehensive reviews). In a typical retro-cue experiment, participants
79 encode an array of items for subsequent report. During the ensuing delay period a cue indicates
80 which of the original items is most likely to be tested. Relative to a no-cue or neutral-cue
81 baseline, valid cues typically yield greater memory performance while invalid cues typically
82 yield reduced memory performance (though the evidence for invalid cue costs is mixed; see
83 Souza & Oberauer 2016).

84 Several mechanisms may be responsible for retrospective cue benefits in WM
85 performance. For example, multiple studies have reported reductions in load-dependent neural
86 signatures of WM storage following a retrospective cue, suggesting that these cues engage
87 mechanisms that facilitate the removal of irrelevant items from WM (e.g., Kuo et al. 2012;
88 Williams & Woodman, 2012). Other studies have reported changes in lateralized alpha band
89 activity when participants are retrospectively cued to an item that previously appeared in the left
90 or right visual hemifields, consistent with an attentional prioritization of the cued representation
91 (and/or suppression of the uncued representation; e.g., Poch et al. 2014; Myers et al. 2015; van
92 Moorselaar et al. 2018). There is also evidence suggesting that valid retrospective cues trigger
93 mechanisms that insulate cued WM representations from subsequent display or interference (e.g.,

94 Makovski et al., 2010; Pertzov et al. 2013), or mechanisms that facilitate comparisons between
95 cued WM representations and subsequent memory probes (e.g., Souza & Oberauer 2016).

96 Here, we tested several explanations for retrocue benefits by quantifying changes in
97 spatially-specific WM representations before and after the appearance of a retrospective cue.
98 Inspired by earlier work (e.g., Foster et al. 2016), we reconstructed spatially-specific mnemonic
99 representations by applying an inverted encoding model (IEM) to spatiotemporal patterns of
100 alpha band (8-12 Hz) activity recorded while participants performed a retrospectively cued
101 spatial WM task. On each trial participants encoded the locations of two colored discs (blue and
102 red). During neutral trials, an uninformative color cue presented after the encoding display
103 informed participants to remember the locations of both discs across a blank interval. During
104 valid trials a 100% reliable color cue indicated which disc would be probed at the end of the trial.
105 Valid cues were presented either immediately after offset of the encoding display (“Valid Early”
106 trials, VE), or at the midpoint of the subsequent blank period (“Valid Late” trials; VL). We
107 isolated the effects of retrospective cues on spatial WM performance by comparing location-
108 specific WM representations across the neutral and valid conditions. To preview the results,
109 during neutral trials we observed a gradual decrease in the fidelity of location-specific
110 representations with time. During VE trials this decrease was eliminated, while during VL trials
111 it was partially reversed. Our findings thus support the view that retro-cues can engage several
112 different mechanisms that together serve to mitigate information loss during WM storage.

113

114
115
116
117
118
119
120
121
122
123
124
125
126
127
128
129
130
131
132
133
134
135

Methods

Participants. 31 volunteers from the Florida Atlantic University community (ages 18-40, both sexes) completed a single 2.5-hour testing session. All participants self-reported normal or corrected-to-normal visual acuity and were compensated at a rate of \$15/hr. Data from 4 participants were discarded due to an excessive number of electrooculogram artifacts (over 33% of trials). Data from a fifth participant was discarded as s/he withdrew from the study after completing only six of twelve testing blocks. The data reported here reflect the remaining 26 volunteers.

Testing Environment. Participants were seated in a dimly-lit and sound-attenuated (unshielded) recording chamber. Stimuli were generated in MATLAB using Psychtoolbox-3 software (Kleiner et al. 2007) and rendered on a 17-inch Dell CRT monitor cycling at 85 Hz. Participants were seated approximately 60 cm from the display (head position was not constrained).

Spatial Memory Task. The behavioral task was based on an experimental approach described by Sprague et al. (2016). A trial schematic is shown in Figure 1. Participants were instructed to fixate a small dot (subtending 0.2° from a viewing distance of 60 cm) throughout the experiment. Each trial began with a sample display containing two colored discs (one red and one blue). Each disc was presented in one of 9 equally spaced positions (40° to 360° in 40° increments) along the perimeter of an imaginary circle (radius 6° visual angle) centered at the fixation point. A small amount of jitter ($\pm 10^\circ$ polar angle) was added to the location of each disc on each trial to discourage verbal coding strategies (e.g., “the blue disc was at 2 o’clock”).

136 The sample display was extinguished after 500 ms. During “Valid Early” (VE) trials the
137 fixation point changed colors from black to either blue or red. This change served as a 100%
138 valid cue for the disc whose location participants would be asked to report at the end of the trial.
139 The fixation point remained blue (or red) for the remainder of the delay period. During “Valid
140 Late” trials (VL), the color of the fixation point initially changed from black to purple,
141 instructing participants to remember the locations of both discs. At the midpoint of the delay
142 period (1250 ms after offset of the sample display) the fixation point changed colors from purple
143 to either blue or red; this change served as a 100% valid cue for the disc whose location
144 participants would be asked to report at the end of the trial. The fixation dot remained red or blue
145 for the remainder of the second delay period (1251-2500 ms after sample offset). Finally, during
146 neutral trials the color of the fixation point changed from black to purple and remained purple
147 across the entire 2500 ms delay period.

148 Each trial concluded with a test display containing a blue or red fixation point, a mouse
149 cursor, and a question mark symbol (“?”) above the fixation point. Participants were required to
150 click on the location of the disc indicated by the color of the fixation point within a 3000 ms
151 response window. Memory performance was quantified as the absolute angular distance between
152 the polar location of the probed disc and the polar location reported by the participant.
153 Performance feedback (mean absolute recall error; i.e., the mean absolute difference between the
154 polar angle reported by the participant and the polar location of the probed disc) was given at the
155 end of each block. Participants completed 10 (N = 1), 11 (N = 2), or 12 (N = 23) blocks of 72
156 trials. Cue conditions (VE, VL, neutral) were counterbalanced within each block, while the
157 spatial positions of the red and blue discs were counterbalanced across sub-sessions of six
158 blocks.

159
160 *EEG Acquisition and Preprocessing.* Continuous EEG was recorded from 62 scalp electrodes via
161 a BrainProducts actiCHamp amplifier (Munich, Germany). Additional electrodes were placed
162 over the left and right mastoids. Electrode impedances were kept below 15 k Ω . Data were
163 recorded with a right mastoid reference and digitized at 1000 Hz. The horizontal
164 electrooculogram (EOG) was recorded from electrodes located \sim 1 cm from the left and right
165 canthi while the vertical EOG was recorded from electrodes placed above and below the right
166 eye. Data were later re-referenced to the algebraic mean of the left and right mastoids, bandpass
167 filtered from 0.1 to 40 Hz (3rd order zero-phase forward-and-reverse Butterworth filters),
168 epoched from -1000 to +4000 ms relative to the start of each trial, and baseline-corrected from -
169 100 to 0 ms relative to the start of each trial. Trials contaminated by blinks or horizontal eye
170 movements greater than \sim 2.5 $^{\circ}$ (assuming a normative voltage threshold of 16 μ V/ $^{\circ}$; Lins et al.
171 1993) were excluded from subsequent analyses. Noisy electrodes were identified and removed
172 by visual inspection. Across participants, we rejected an average (\pm 1 S.E.M.) of 12.38%
173 (\pm 1.83%) trials and 1.04 (\pm 0.23) electrodes.

174
175 *Inverted Encoding Model.* Following earlier work (e.g., Foster et al. 2016) we used an inverted
176 encoding model to reconstruct location-specific representations of the red and blue discs during
177 the sample display and subsequent delay period. Reconstructions of stimulus locations were
178 computed from the spatial topography of induced alpha-band (8-12 Hz) power measured across
179 17 occipitoparietal electrode sites: O1, O2, Oz, PO7, PO3, POz, PO4, PO8, P7, P5, P3, P1, Pz,
180 P2, P4, P6, and P8. Robust representations of spatial position could also be reconstructed from
181 frontal, central, and temporal electrode sites, but these representations were substantially weaker

182 than those reconstructed from occipitoparietal electrode sites. To isolate alpha-band activity, the
 183 raw EEG time series at each electrode was bandpass filtered from 8-12 Hz (3rd order zero-phase
 184 forward-and-reverse Butterworth), yielding a real-valued signal $f(t)$. The analytic representation
 185 of $f(t)$ was obtained by applying a Hilbert transformation:

186

$$z(t) = f(t) + if(t)$$

187

188 where $i = \sqrt{-1}$ and $if(t) = A(t)e^{i\varphi(t)}$. Induced alpha power was computed by extracting and
 189 squaring the instantaneous amplitude $A(t)$ of the analytic signal $z(t)$.

190 We modeled alpha power at each scalp electrode as a weighted sum of 9 location-
 191 selective channels, each with an idealized tuning curve (a half-wave rectified cosine raised to the
 192 8th power). The maximum response of each channel was normalized to 1, thus units of response
 193 are arbitrary. The predicted responses of each channel during each trial were arranged in a k
 194 channel by n trials design matrix C . Separate design matrices were constructed to track the
 195 locations of the blue and red discs across trial (i.e., we reconstructed the locations of the blue and
 196 red discs separately, then later sorted these reconstructions according to cue condition).

197 The relationship between the data and the predicted channel responses C is given by a
 198 general linear model of the form:

199

$$B = WC + N$$

200

201 where B is a m electrode by n trials training data matrix, W is an m electrode by k channel weight
 202 matrix, and N is a matrix of residuals (i.e., noise).

203 To estimate W , we constructed a “training” data set containing an equal number of trials
 204 from each stimulus location (i.e., 40-360° in 40° steps). We first identified the location ϕ with
 205 the fewest r repetitions in the full data set after EOG artifact removal. Next, we constructed a
 206 training data set B_{trn} (m electrodes by n trials) and weight matrix C_{trn} (n trials by k channels) by
 207 randomly selecting (without replacement) 1: r trials for each of the nine possible stimulus
 208 locations (ignoring cue condition; i.e., the training data set contained a mixture of VE, VL, and
 209 Neutral trials). The training data set was used to compute a weight for each channel C_i via least-
 210 squares estimation:

211

$$W_i = B_{trn} C_{trn,i}^T (C_{trn,i} C_{trn,i}^T)^{-1}$$

212

213 where $C_{trn,i}$ is an n trial row vector containing the predicted responses of spatial channel i during
 214 each training trial.

215 The weights W were used to estimate a set of spatial filters V that capture the underlying
 216 channel responses while accounting for correlated variability between electrode sites (i.e., the
 217 noise covariance; Kok et al. 2017):

218

$$V_i = \frac{\Sigma_i^{-1} W_i}{W_i^T \Sigma_i^{-1} W_i}$$

219

220 where Σ_i is the regularized noise covariance matrix for channel i and estimated as:

221

$$\Sigma_i = \frac{1}{n-1} \epsilon_i \epsilon_i^T$$

222

223 where n is the number of training trials and ϵ_i is a matrix of residuals:

224

$$\epsilon_i = B_{trn} - W_i C_{trn,i}$$

225

226 Estimates of ϵ_i were obtained by regularization-based shrinkage using an analytically
 227 determined shrinkage parameter (see Blankertz et al. 2011; Kok et al. 2017). An optimal spatial
 228 filter v_i was estimated for each channel C_i , yielding an m electrode by k filter matrix V .

229 Next, we constructed a “test” data set B_{tst} (m electrodes by n trials) containing data from
 230 all trials not included in the training data set and estimated trial-by-trial channel responses C_{tst} (k
 231 channels x n trials) from the filter matrix V and the test data set:

232

$$C_{tst} = V^T B_{tst}$$

233

234 Trial-by-trial channel responses were interpolated to 360° , circularly shifted to a common
 235 center (0° , by convention), and sorted by cue condition (i.e., VE, VL, neutral). To quantify the
 236 effects of retrospective cues on spatial memory representations, we obtained an estimate of
 237 location specific information by converting the (averaged) channel response estimates for each
 238 cue condition to polar form and projected them onto a vector with angle 0° :

239

$$r = |z| \cos(\arg(z)), \quad z = ce^{2i\varphi}$$

240

241 where c is a vector of estimated channel responses and φ is the vector of angles at which the
242 channels peak.

243 To ensure internal reliability this entire analysis was repeated 100 times, and unique
244 (randomly chosen) subsets of trials were used to define the training and test data sets during each
245 permutation. The results were then averaged across permutations.

246

247 *Estimating the Temporal Resolution of Location Information Estimates.* As described in the
248 preceding section, location-specific reconstructions (and hence, estimates of location
249 information) were computed using instantaneous distributions of alpha power across electrode
250 sites at each time point. However, the bandpass filter used to isolate alpha band activity (8-12
251 Hz) can introduce temporal distortions, making it difficult to make precise statements about the
252 temporal resolution of the analysis pipeline. To formally investigate this issue, we generated a
253 3000 ms sinusoid with unit amplitude and a frequency of 10 Hz (along with 1000 ms of pre- and
254 post-signal zero padding for a total signal length of 5000 ms) and ran it through the filtering
255 routine used to identify alpha-band activity (defined as 8-12 Hz) in the raw EEG signal.
256 Temporal distortions caused by filtering were defined as points where the amplitude of the
257 filtered signal reached 25% of maximum (1.0). For a perfect filter, these points would occur at
258 precisely 1000 and 4000 ms relative to stimulus onset. In reality, we obtained estimates of 963
259 4039 ms, or 37 ms prior to and 39 ms after stimulus onset. Thus, we estimated the temporal
260 resolution of our analysis path as approximately ± 40 ms. That is, if estimates of location
261 information are significantly above zero at a given time point, then we can be certain that the
262 spatial distribution of alpha power across electrode sites contained robust information about that
263 location at some point within ± 40 ms.

264

265 *Statistical Comparisons.* We used a nonparametric sign permutation test to quantify differences
266 between estimates of location information across stimuli (cued vs. uncued) and cue conditions
267 (i.e., VE, VL, and neutral trials). Each test we performed – e.g., whether estimated location
268 information is reliably above zero or whether estimated location information is higher for the
269 cued vs. uncued disc – assumes a null statistic of 0. We therefore generated a null distribution of
270 location information estimates by randomly inverting the sign of each participant’s data (with
271 50% probability) and averaging the data across participants. This procedure was repeated 10,000
272 times, yielding a 10,000-element null distribution for each time point. Finally, we implemented a
273 cluster-based permutation test with cluster-forming and cluster-size thresholds of $p < 0.05$ to
274 correct for multiple comparisons across time points (see Maris & Oostenveld, 2011; Wolff et al.
275 2017).

276

277 *Eye Movement Control Analyses.* Although we excluded trials contaminated by horizontal eye
278 movements, small but reliable biases in eye position towards the location(s) of the remembered
279 disc(s) could nevertheless contribute to reconstructions of stimulus location. We examined this
280 possibility in two complementary analyses. In the first analysis, we computed angular
281 measurements of eye position by converting trial-by-trial horizontal and vertical EOG recordings
282 to polar format (using normative scaling values of $16 \mu\text{V}/^\circ$ and $12 \mu\text{V}/^\circ$ for the horizontal and
283 vertical EOG channels, respectively; Lins et al. 1993; Bae & Luck 2018), then constructed
284 circular histograms of angular estimates of eye position as a function of stimulus location.
285 Angular eye position estimates at each timepoint were sorted into nine bins whose centers
286 matched the possible stimulus positions (i.e., 40° to 360° in 40° increments). For simplicity we

287 restricted our analysis to VE trials where consistent biases in eye position should be most
 288 apparent (i.e., because participants were only required to remember one location).

289 In the second analysis, we regressed trial-by-trial horizontal EOG recordings (in μV ; see
 290 Foster et al. 2016) onto the horizontal position of the remembered disc, again focusing on VE
 291 trials. Positive regression coefficients thus reflect greater changes in eye position as a function of
 292 stimulus location. Separate regressions were run for each participant and the resulting
 293 coefficients were averaged across participants.

294

295 *Quantifying Sources of Location Information Loss and Recovery.* We evaluated potential sources
 296 of change in location-specific representations via curve-fitting analyses (e.g., Ester et al. 2015;
 297 Ester et al. 2016). We first computed a one-dimensional reconstructed representation of location
 298 for each participant by averaging channel responses over time (separately for the first and second
 299 delay periods). Reconstructions were averaged across participants and fit with a circular function
 300 of the form

301

$$f(x) = \alpha e^{k \cos(\mu - x) - 1} + \beta$$

302

303 where x is a vector of polar locations and β is an additive scaling parameter. The additional
 304 parameters α , μ , and k control the amplitude, center, and concentration (i.e., the inverse of
 305 bandwidth) of the function. α , β , μ , and k were estimated separately for each condition via an
 306 iterative minimization algorithm (Nelder-Mead simplex as implemented by MATLAB's
 307 “fminsearch” function).

308 Differences in parameters across conditions (i.e., first vs. second delay and neutral vs. VE
309 vs. VL) were evaluated using a bootstrap test. For each comparison we selected (with
310 replacement) and averaged 26 of 26 participant reconstructions from the two conditions of
311 interest (e.g., neutral delay 1 and VE delay 1). The resulting average functions were fit with the
312 circular function described above, yielding a set of parameter estimates for each condition. This
313 procedure was repeated 10,000 times, and we computed empirical p-values for differences in
314 parameter estimates across conditions by estimating the total proportion of permutations where
315 parameter estimates in one condition were greater than (or less than) estimates for the other
316 condition.

317

318 *Within-participant Variability.* We report estimates of within-participant variability (e.g., 95%
319 within-participant confidence intervals) throughout the paper. These estimates discard subject
320 variance (e.g., overall differences in response strength) and instead reflect variance related to the
321 subject by condition(s) interaction term(s) (e.g., variability in response strength across
322 experimental conditions; Loftus & Masson, 1994; Cousineau 2005). We used the approach
323 described by Cousineau (2005): raw data (e.g., location information or channel response
324 estimates) were de-meant on a participant by participant basis, and the grand mean across
325 participants was added to each participant's zero-centered data. The grand mean centered data
326 were then used to compute bootstrapped within-participant confidence intervals (10,000
327 permutations).

328

329

Results

330
331 *Valid Retrocues Enhance Memory Performance.* We recorded EEG while participants performed
332 a retrospectively cued spatial WM task (Figure 1). During neutral trials, an uninformative cue
333 instructed participants to remember the locations of two colored discs across a blank delay
334 period. During valid trials a 100% reliable color cue indicated which disc would be probed at the
335 end of the trial. Valid cues were presented immediately after termination of the encoding display
336 (valid early trials; VE) or midway through the subsequent blank delay period (valid late trials;
337 VL). At the end of the trial, participants recalled the location of the probed disc via a mouse
338 click. Behavioral performance was quantified as mean absolute recall error (i.e., the mean
339 absolute difference between the polar angle reported by the participant and the polar location of
340 the probed disc). Figure 2 plots behavioral performance as a function of trial type (i.e., neutral,
341 VE, VL). Consistent with earlier findings (Sprague et al., 2016), average absolute recall error
342 was reliably lower during VE and VL trials ($M = 7.75^\circ$ and 8.26° , respectively) relative to
343 neutral trials ($M = 8.96^\circ$; false-discovery rate corrected bootstrap tests, $p < 0.001$). Average
344 absolute recall error was also reliably lower during VE relative to VL trials (bootstrap test; $p <$
345 0.001). Thus, valid retro-cues improved WM performance.

346
347 *Reconstructing Location-specific WM Representations from Alpha-band Activity.* Building upon
348 earlier work (Foster et al. 2016; Samaha et al. 2016), we used an inverted encoding model to
349 reconstruct the locations of the cued and uncued discs from spatiotemporal patterns of induced α -
350 band power measured across occipitoparietal electrode sites (see *Inverted Encoding Model*,
351 *Methods*). Briefly, we modeled instantaneous induced α -power at each electrode site as a
352 weighted combination of 9 location-selective channels, each with an idealized response function.

353 The resulting channel weights were then used to calculate a predicted response for each channel
354 given spatiotemporal distributions of α -power measured during an independent test data set.
355 Separate reconstructions were computed for each disc irrespective of cue condition, and the
356 individual reconstructions were averaged to yield a single time-resolved representation of
357 location-specific activity. Consistent with earlier findings (Foster et al. 2016) trial-by-trial
358 variability in channel responses reliably tracked the angular locations of the cued and uncued
359 discs (Figure 3A). For convenience, we circularly shifted reconstructions for each stimulus
360 location to a common center (0° by convention) and averaged the centered reconstructions across
361 locations, yielding a single time-resolved reconstruction. Finally, we converted these centered
362 reconstructions to polar form and projected them onto a unit vector with an angle of 0° . As
363 shown in Figure 3C, location information increased rapidly following presentation of the sample
364 display and reached an asymptotic limit approximately 400-500 ms later. During the subsequent
365 delay period location information gradually decreased with time, though overall information
366 levels remained reliably above 0 for the duration of the trial. Thus, our analytical approach
367 allowed us to visualize spatially-specific WM representations with high temporal precision.
368

369 *Comparison of Spatial Representations During Encoding.* The central goal of this study was to
370 examine the effects of retrospective cues on reconstructed spatial WM representations. Although
371 participants had no way of knowing what type of cue would be presented on each trial, it is
372 conceivable that differences in reconstructions across cue conditions during the encoding phase
373 of the trial contributed to subsequent differences across retrospective cue conditions. We
374 evaluated this possibility by directly comparing estimates of location information across
375 retrospective cue conditions (VE, VL, and Neutral; Figure 4A). As shown in Figure 4B,

376 estimates of location information were remarkably consistent across cue conditions, and we
377 failed to identify any statistically robust differences in location information as a function of cue
378 condition over the entire 500 ms encoding period (false-discovery-rate-corrected cluster-based
379 permutation tests, $p > 0.05$). Thus, we can be certain that any effects of cue type during the
380 subsequent WM period are not due to differences that emerged during encoding.

381

382 *Degradation of Spatial WM Representations During Neutral Trials.* Next, we examined the
383 effects of retro-cues cues on reconstructed spatially-specific WM representations. Since all
384 retrospective cues were presented after the offset of the sample display, we limited our analyses
385 to the 2500 ms blank interval separating the offset of the sample display and the onset of the
386 probe display.

387 During neutral trials, a retrospective cue presented immediately after offset of the sample
388 display instructed participants to remember the locations of both discs. As shown in Figure 5A,
389 location information decreased monotonically over the course of the delay period (linear slope =
390 -62.97 units/sec; $p < 0.002$, bootstrap test) with information reaching levels indistinguishable
391 from 0 by the onset of the probe display. We next examined possible sources of information loss,
392 including reductions in reconstruction amplitude (i.e., a lower signal-to-noise ratio; Sprague et al.
393 2014; 2016) or increases in reconstruction bandwidth (i.e., a loss of spatial precision; Ester et al.
394 2013). We averaged each participant's time-resolved location reconstructions over periods from
395 0-1250 ms and 1251-2500 ms after the offset of the sample display (Figure 5B). Each
396 reconstruction was fit with a circular function containing free parameters for amplitude (i.e.,
397 maximum over baseline response), concentration (the inverse of bandwidth), and center (see
398 *Quantifying Sources of Information Loss and Recovery, Methods*). As shown in Figure 5C, we

399 observed a decrease in response amplitude across the first and second half of the delay period,
400 but no change in concentration. Thus, requiring participants to store multiple spatial WM
401 representations was associated with a gradual decrease in the strength of each representation over
402 time.

403
404 *Valid Retrocues Presented Immediately After Encoding Eliminate Information Loss.* During VE
405 trials, a retrospective cue presented immediately after the sample display indicated which disc
406 (blue or red) would be probed with 100% certainty. In contrast to the pattern seen during neutral
407 trials (Figure 5), location information for the cued disc remained constant across the delay period
408 (Figure 6; linear slope = -17.8 units/sec; $p = 0.06$; bootstrap test). Contrary to prior results
409 suggesting a cue-driven increase in information over-and-above that observed during encoding
410 (e.g., Rerko et al., 2014; Schneegans & Bays, 2017), we found no evidence for a strengthening of
411 the cued location immediately after cue onset (obtained by comparing average location
412 information over epochs spanning the last 100 ms of the sample period and the first 500 ms of
413 the delay period; $p = 0.93$, bootstrap test). Conversely, location information for the uncued disc
414 quickly fell to 0. The rate of information loss for the uncued disc during the first 1250 ms of the
415 delay period during VE trials was nearly double that observed for during the same interval of
416 neutral trials (linear slopes of -143.61 vs. 74.18 units/sec; $p < 0.02$; bootstrap test). Clear
417 differences between location information estimates for the cued and uncued discs emerged
418 approximately 600 ms after cue onset and persisted throughout the remainder of the delay period
419 (Figure 6B; red markers). This delay is consistent with behavioral studies suggesting that it takes
420 participants approximately 300-600 ms to process and utilize a retrospective cue (e.g., Souza et
421 al., 2014).

422 To summarize, we observed a monotonic decrease in location information with time
423 when participants were required to hold two locations in WM (Figure 5). A retrospective cue
424 presented immediately after termination of the sample display eliminated this decline for the
425 cued location and hastened it for the uncued location (Figure 6). The observation that a
426 retrospective cue mitigates information loss for a cued item is consistent with behavioral and
427 physiological findings suggesting that retrospectively cued shifts of attention insulate cued WM
428 representations from subsequent degradation due to interference or decay (e.g., Pertzov et al.
429 2013).

430
431 *Recovery of Location Information Following a Delayed Retrospective Cue.* In a recent study,
432 Sprague et al. (2016; see also Rose et al. 2016; Wolff et al. 2017) documented an apparent
433 recovery of location-specific information following a delayed retro-cue. We tested for a similar
434 effect by examining the effect of a delayed retrocue on location information (Figure 7). During
435 VL trials a neutral cue instructed participants to remember the locations of both discs. Halfway
436 through the delay period the neutral cue changed colors to either blue or red, indicating with
437 100% probability which disc would be probed. As shown in Figure 7A, location information
438 decreased gradually over the course of the first delay period (0-1250 ms after the sample display;
439 linear slope = -120.78 units/sec; $p < 0.002$, bootstrap test) and continued to decline for the
440 uncued disc during the second delay period (black line). Conversely, location information for the
441 cued item appeared to increase during the second delay period (green line). To evaluate these
442 changes, we computed average location information for the cued and uncued disc after dividing
443 the second delay period into early and late epochs (1250-1700 ms and 2050-2500 ms after
444 sample offset, respectively; Figure 7B) based on visual inspection of the plots shown in Figure

445 7A. Estimates of location information were identical for the cued and uncued discs during the
446 early epoch and diverged during the late epoch. Direct comparisons of information estimates
447 during the early and late epochs revealed reliably larger information estimates for the cued disc
448 ($p < 0.007$) and reliably lower information estimates for the uncued disc ($p < 0.015$) during the
449 late epoch. We examined sources of location information recovery via a curve fitting analysis.
450 Specifically, we computed and quantified the amplitude and concentration of time-averaged
451 reconstructions of the cued disc during the early and late portions of the second delay period
452 (i.e., 1250-1700 ms and 2050-2500 ms; Figure 7C). Consistent with earlier findings (e.g.,
453 Sprague et al. 2016) we observed significantly larger amplitude estimates during the late relative
454 to the earlier epoch (Figure 7D; $p < 0.001$; the difference between concentration estimates during
455 the early and late periods was not significant; $p = 0.0543$). Thus, in addition to protecting
456 representations of cued items from subsequent degradation (Figure 5), under some circumstances
457 a retrospectively cued shift of attention can directly enhance the representation of a cued item
458 (Figure 7).

459
460 *Ruling Out Contributions from Eye Movements.* We identified and excluded trials contaminated
461 by horizontal eye movements greater than 2.5° (based on a normative voltage threshold of 16
462 $\mu\text{V}/^\circ$; Lins et al. 1993). Nevertheless, small but consistent biases in eye position may have
463 contributed to reconstructions of stimulus location. We examined this possibility in two
464 complementary analyses (see *Eye Movement Control Analyses*, Methods). First, we computed
465 angular estimates of eye position from horizontal and vertical EOG recordings and constructed
466 circular histograms of eye position as a function of remembered stimulus location (Figure 8A).
467 Distributions of eye position were remarkably similar across stimulus locations, suggesting that

468 the location-specific reconstructions shown in Figures 3-7 cannot be solely explained by subtle
469 biases in eye position. This conclusion was further supported by a complementary analysis in
470 which we regressed time-resolved estimates of horizontal EOG activity onto remembered
471 stimulus locations (Figure 8B). Time-resolved regression coefficients were indistinguishable
472 from zero across each trial, again suggesting that systematic biases in eye position are
473 insufficient to account for the location-specific reconstructions reported here.

474

Discussion

475
476 WM performance can be improved by a retrospective cue presented after encoding is
477 complete (Griffin & Nobre, 2003; Landman et al. 2003; Souza & Oberauer, 2016; Myers et al.
478 2017). Several mechanisms have been proposed to explain retrospective cue benefits in WM
479 performance, including the removal of irrelevant information from WM (e.g., Kuo et al. 2012;
480 Souza & Oberauer, 2016), attentional enhancement of the cued representation (e.g., Myers et al.,
481 2015), protection of the cued representation from subsequent decay or interference (e.g., due to
482 competition from other memory representations or subsequent sensory input; Makovski & Jiang,
483 2007; Pertzov et al., 2013), or retrieval head start (e.g., Souza et al. 2016). Evaluating these
484 alternatives has proven difficult, in part because extant studies examining the effects of
485 retrospective cues have relied almost exclusively on behavioral reports and/or indirect neural
486 signatures of WM storage. In the current study, we overcame this limitation by directly
487 examining changes in spatially-specific WM representations before and after the appearance of a
488 retrospective cue. Our approach was predicated on recent studies demonstrating that topographic
489 distributions of induced alpha-band activity encode precise location-specific information during
490 covert attention tasks (Foster et al., 2017) and spatial WM tasks (Foster et al., 2016), and it
491 allowed us to visualize and quantify cue-driven changes in WM representations with high
492 temporal resolution. Our key findings are summarized in Figure 9. During neutral trials an
493 uninformative retrospective cue instructed participants to remember the locations of two discs
494 across a blank display, and we observed a gradual degradation the strength of location-specific
495 WM representations with time (Figure 4). During VE trials a 100% reliable retrospective cue
496 was presented immediately after termination of the sample display. This cue eliminated time-
497 based degradation for the representation of the cued disc and hastened it for the uncued disc

498 (Figure 5). Finally, during VL trials a neutral retrospective cue was replaced with a 100%
499 reliable retrospective cue midway through the delay period. We observed a gradual degradation
500 in location-specific WM representations during the neutral phase of the trial followed by a partial
501 recovery of location during the valid phase of the trial (Figure 6). Collectively, our findings
502 suggest that retrospective cues can engage multiple mechanisms to minimize and/or reverse
503 information loss during WM storage (Sprague et al., 2015).

504 The loss of location information observed during Neutral and VL trials need not imply a
505 loss of memory. Indeed, the fact that participants perform quite well during neutral trials despite
506 an apparent absence of location information suggests at least a partial dissociation between alpha
507 band activity and spatial WM performance. However, there are at least two ways to explain this:
508 one possibility is that spatial WM representations remain stable during the delay period, but
509 location information carried by the alpha-band signal degrades with time. A second possibility is
510 that the memory representations are (partially or wholly) consolidated into a new format not
511 indexed by alpha band activity. The pattern of results we observed during VL trials supports the
512 latter alternative. Under the constraints of information theory (specifically, the data processing
513 inequality theorem; Shannon, 1948), the total information about one variable given the state of
514 another variable (i.e., mutual information) cannot be increased through additional processing.
515 For example, applying multiplicative gain to a noisy spatial WM representation (e.g., by shifting
516 attention to the cued location) would amplify signal and noise to the same extent, resulting in a
517 stronger response but no increase in the information content of the signal (e.g., Sprague et al.
518 2016; Bays & Taylor et al., 2018). Thus, once location information is lost it cannot be recovered
519 through any amount of additional processing, unless participants have access to an additional
520 source of information. Since there was no external source of location information during the

521 delay period, we can infer that participants were able to access an internal source of information
522 that is not indexed by alpha band activity, including but not limited to an “activity-silent” WM
523 system (Sprague et al. 2016; Rose et al. 2016; Wolff et al. 2017) or long-term memory (Sutterer
524 et al. 2018).

525 Psychophysical studies suggest that retrospective cues engage mechanisms that insulate
526 or protect cued representations from subsequent degradation (Matsukura et al. 2007; Pertzov et
527 al. 2013). Our findings provide strong support for this view. Specifically, in the absence of a
528 retrospective cue we observed a gradual degradation in location-specific WM representations
529 with time (Figure 4A). However, a 100% valid retrospective cue presented immediately after the
530 encoding display eliminated degradation in the representation of the cued disc and accelerated
531 degradation in the representation of the uncued disc. Rapid degradation of the representation of
532 the uncued disc is nominally consistent with studies suggesting that retrospective cues engage
533 mechanisms that facilitate the removal of uncued items from WM (Astle et al. 2012; Kuo et al.,
534 2012; Williams et al., 2013; Williams & Woodman, 2012). However, it is unclear whether rapid
535 degradation reflects the operation of an active mechanism that purges irrelevant information
536 from WM or the passive (but rapid) decay of information following the withdrawal of attention.
537 This question awaits further scrutiny.

538 During VL trials, we observed a partial recovery of location information during the
539 second half of the delay period (Figure 6). This result dovetails with several recent empirical
540 studies (Lewis-Peacock et al., 2012; LaRocque et al., 2013; Rose et al. 2016; Sprague et al.,
541 2016; Wolff et al., 2017) documenting a recovery or “resurrection” of decodable stimulus
542 information following a retrospective cue or neurostimulation. Many of these studies have
543 interpreted this recovery as evidence for the existence of an additional, “latent” WM system

544 based on short-term synaptic plasticity that can be used to supplement active storage mechanisms
545 such as sustained spiking activity (e.g., Barak & Tsodyks, 2014; Stokes, 2015). Schneegans and
546 Bays (2017) recently challenged this conclusion by demonstrating that a neural process model
547 based on sustained spiking activity can yield a recovery of location information in a
548 retrospectively cued spatial WM task similar to the one used in this study (see also Sprague et al.
549 2016). In this model, a colored retrospective cue provides a uniform or homogeneous boost in
550 the activity of one of two neural populations with joint selectivity for a specific color (e.g., red)
551 and location. This boost – coupled with inhibitory interactions between the two neural
552 populations – provides a plausible explanation for the partial recovery of location information
553 following a retrospective cue that was observed during VL trial. However, this model would also
554 predict a boost in location information above and beyond that seen during encoding following
555 the presentation of the retrospective cue during VE trials (see also related empirical findings by
556 Rerko et al., 2014; Souza et al. 2014). Our findings do not support this prediction: we saw no
557 evidence for an increase in location information following presentation of the retrospective cue
558 during VE trials (Figure 5). This implies that there is an upper limit on the information content of
559 reconstructed spatial WM representations that is determined during encoding. Further studies
560 will be needed to explore this possibility in detail.

561 The absence of a boost in reconstructed spatial WM representations during VE trials
562 (Figure 5) conflicts with psychophysical studies suggesting that retrospectively cued shifts of
563 attention can strengthen WM representations over and above their original encoding strength
564 (e.g., Rerko et al. 2014; Souza et al. 2016). It is also nominally inconsistent with findings
565 reported by Sprague et al. (2016), who observed an increase in the amplitude of a reconstructed
566 spatial WM representation reconstructed from hemodynamic activity when a valid cue was

567 presented immediately after an encoding display (compared to a neutral cue condition).
568 However, the sluggish nature of the human hemodynamic response makes it difficult to infer the
569 source(s) of this effect. Indeed, the data reported by Sprague et al. were acquired with a temporal
570 resolution of 2250 ms, or nearly the length of the entire delay period in the current study. Thus,
571 higher amplitude representations during valid trials could in principle reflect a boost in
572 reconstructed representations over and above their original encoding strength (e.g., Rerko et al.,
573 2014; Souza et al. 2016; Schneegans & Bays 2017) or later degradation in reconstructed
574 representations during neutral trials. Our approach allowed us to disambiguate these possibilities
575 by tracking changes in location-specific reconstructions with a temporal resolution on the order
576 of tens of milliseconds.

577 Our findings are consistent with studies have documenting links alpha band topography
578 and spatial attention both across and within visual hemifields (e.g., Rihs et al. 2007;
579 Bahramsharif et al. 2010), as well as more recent work demonstrating that momentary changes in
580 alpha band topography can be used to track the locus of spatial attention with high temporal
581 resolution (e.g., Foster et al. 2017). In addition, we have shown that alpha band topography can
582 be used to visualize and track changes in reconstructed WM representations following a
583 retrospective cue. In the absence of a cue we observed a monotonic decrease in memory strength
584 with time. A cue presented immediately after the termination of the encoding display eliminated
585 this decrease and a cue presented midway through the subsequent delay period partially reversed
586 it. Collectively our findings provide new and compelling evidence that depending on
587 circumstances retrospectively cued shifts of attention can (a) prevent subsequent information loss
588 during WM storage, (b) partially reverse prior information loss, and (c) possibly facilitate the
589 removal of irrelevant items from WM.

590
591
592
593
594
595
596
597
598
599
600
601
602
603
604
605
606
607
608
609
610
611
612
613

References

- Astle DE, Summerfield J, Griffin I, Nobre AC. Orienting attention to locations in mental representations. *Attn Percept Psychophys* 74:146-162 (2012)
- Bae G-Y, Luck SJ. Dissociable decoding of spatial attention and working memory from EEG oscillations and sustained potentials. *J Neurosci* 38:409-422. (2018)
- Bahramisharif A, van Gerven M, Heskes T, Jensen O. Covert attention allows for continuous control of brain-computer interfaces. *Eur J Neurosci* 31: 1501-1508 (2010)
- Barak O, Tsodyks M. Working models of working memory. *Curr Opin Neurobiol* 25:20-24 (2014)
- Bays PM, Taylor R. A neural model of retrospective attention in visual working memory. *Cognition* 100:43-52 (2018)
- Blankertz B, Lemm S, Treder M, Gaufe S, Müller K-R. Single-trial analysis and classification of ERP components – A tutorial. *NeuroImage* 56:814-825 (2011)
- Cousineau D. Confidence intervals in within-subject designs: A simpler solution to Loftus and Masson’s method. *Tutorials in Quantitative Methods for Psychology*. 1:42-45 (2005)
- Cowan N. The magical number 4 in short-term memory: A reconsideration of mental storage capacity. *Behav Brain Sci* 24:87-185 (2000)
- Ester EF, Anderson DE, Serences JT, Awh E. A neural measure of precision in visual working memory. *J Cogn Neurosci* 25:754-761 (2013)
- Ester EF, Sprague TC, Serences JT. Parietal and frontal cortex encode stimulus-specific mnemonic representations during visual working memory. *Neuron* 87:893-905. (2015)
- Ester EF, Sutterer DW, Serences JT, Awh E. Feature-selective attentional modulations in human frontoparietal cortex. *J Neurosci* 36:8188-8199. (2016)

- 614 Foster JJ, Sutterer DW, Serences JT, Vogel EK, Awh E. The topography of alpha-band activity
615 tracks the content of spatial working memory. *J Neurophysiol* 115:168-177 (2016)
- 616 Foster JJ, Sutterer DW, Serences JT, Vogel EK, Awh E. Alpha-band oscillations enable spatially
617 and temporally resolved tracking of cover spatial attention. *Psychol Sci* 28:929-941
618 (2017)
- 619 Griffin IC, Nobre AC. Orienting attention to locations in internal representations. *J Cogn*
620 *Neurosci* 15:1176-1194 (2003)
- 621 Kleiner M, Brainard D, Pelli D. What's new in Psychtoolbox-3? *Perception* (2007)
- 622 Kok P, Mostert P, de Lange FP. Prior expectations induce prestimulus sensory templates. *Proc*
623 *Natl Acad Sci USA* (2017)
- 624 Kuo B, Stokes MG, Nobre AC. Attention modulates maintenance of representations in visual
625 short-term memory. *J Cogn Neurosci* 24:51-60. (2012)
- 626 Landman R, Spekreijse H, Lamme VAF. Large capacity storage of integrated objects before
627 change blindness. *Vision Research* 43:149-164
- 628 LaRocque JJ, Lewis-Peacock JA, Drysdale AT, Oberauer K, Postle BR. Decoding attended
629 information in short-term memory: An EEG study. *J Cogn Neurosci* 25:127-142 (2013).
- 630 Lewis-Peacock JA, Drysdale AT, Oberauer K, Postle BR. Neural evidence for a distinction
631 between short-term memory and the focus of attention. *J Cogn Neurosci* 24:61-79 (2012).
- 632 Lins OG, Picton TW, Berg P, Scherg M. Ocular artifacts in EEG and event-related potentials I:
633 Scalp topography. *Brain Topography* 6:51-63. (1993)
- 634 Loftus GR, Masson MEJ. Using confidence intervals in within-subject designs. *Psych Bull Rev*
635 1:476-490. (1994)

- 636 Luck SJ, Vogel EK. Visual working memory capacity: From psychophysics and neurobiology to
637 individual differences. *Trends Cogn Sci* 17:391-400 (2013)
- 638 Ma WJ, Husain M, Bays PM. Changing concepts of working memory. *Nat Neurosci* 17:347-356
639 (2014)
- 640 Makovski T, Jiang YV. Distributing versus focusing attention in visual short-term memory.
641 *Psychon Bull Rev* 14:1072-1078 (2007)
- 642 Makovski T, Watson LM, Koutstall W, Jiang YV. Method matters: Systematic effects of testing
643 procedure on visual working memory. *J Exp Psychol Learn* 36:1466-1479 (2010).
- 644 Maris E, Oostenveld R. Nonparametric statistical testing of EEG and MEG data. *J Neurosci*
645 *Methods* 164: 177-190 (2007)
- 646 Matsukura M, Luck SJ, Vecera SP. Attention effects during visual short-term memory
647 maintenance: Protection or prioritization? *Perception & Psychophysics* 69:1422-1434
648 (2007)
- 649 Myers NE, Walther L, Wallis G, Stokes MG, Nobre AC. Temporal dynamics of attention during
650 encoding versus maintenance of working memory: Complementary views from event-
651 related potentials and alpha-band oscillations. *J Cogn Neurosci* 27:492-508. (2015)
- 652 Myers NE, Stokes MG, Nobre AC. Prioritizing information during working memory: Beyond
653 sustained internal attention. *Trends Cogn Sci* 21:449-461 (2017)
- 654 Pertzov Y, Bays PM, Joseph S, Husain M. Rapid forgetting prevented by retrospective attention.
655 *J Exp Psychol: Hum* 39:1224-1231 (2012)
- 656 Poch C, Campo P, Barnes GR. Modulation of alpha and gamma oscillations related to
657 retrospectively orienting attention within working memory. *Eur J Neurosci* 40: 2399-
658 2405. (2014)

- 659 Rerko L, Souza AS, Oberauer K. Retro-cue benefits in working memory without sustained focal
660 attention. *Memory & Cognition* 42:712-728 (2014)
- 661 Rihs TA, Christoph MM, Thut G. Mechanisms of selective inhibition in visual spatial attention
662 are indexed by alpha-band EEG synchronization. *Eur J Neurosci* 25:603-610 (2007)
- 663 Rose NS, LaRocque JJ, Rigall AC, Gosseries O, Starrett J, Myering EE, Postle BR. Reactivation
664 of latent working memories with transcranial magnetic stimulation. *Science* 354:1136-
665 1139 (2016).
- 666 Samaha J, Sprague TC, Postle BR. Decoding and reconstructing the focus of spatial attention
667 from the topography of alpha-band oscillations. *J Cogn Neurosci* 29:1090-1097.
- 668 Schneegans S, Bays PM. Restoration of fMRI decodability does not imply latent working
669 memory states. *J Cogn. Neurosci* 29:1977-1994 (2017)
- 670 Shannon CE. A mathematical theory of communication. *Bell Syst. Tech. J.* 27:379-423 (1948)
- 671 Souza AS, Rerko L, Oberauer K. Getting more from visual working memory: Retro-cues
672 enhance retrieval and protect from visual interference. *J Exp Psychol Hum* 42:890-910.
673 (2016)
- 674 Souza AS, Oberauer K. In search of the focus of attention in working memory: 13 years of the
675 retro-cue effect. *Atten Percept Psychophys* 78:1839-1860. (2016)
- 676 Souza AS, Rerko L, Oberauer K. Unloading and reloading working memory: Attending to one
677 item frees capacity. *J Exp Psychol Hum* 40:1237-1256 (2014)
- 678 Sprague TC, Ester EF, Serences JT. Reconstructions of information in visual spatial working
679 memory degrade with memory load. *Curr Biol* 24:2174-2180 (2014)
- 680 Sprague TC, Saproo S, Serences JT. Visual attention mitigates information loss in small- and
681 large-scale neural codes. *Trends Cogn Sci* 189:215-226. (2015)

- 682 Sprague TC, Ester EF, Serences JT. Restoring latent visual working memory representations in
683 human cortex. *Neuron* 91:694-707 (2016)
- 684 Stokes MG. Activity-silent working memory in prefrontal cortex: A dynamic coding perspective.
685 *Trends Cogn Sci* 19:394-405.
- 686 Sutterer DW, Foster JJ, Serences JT, Vogel EK, Awh E. Alpha-band oscillations track the
687 retrieval of precise spatial representations from long-term memory. *bioRxiv* doi:
688 <https://doi.org/10.1101/207860>
- 689 van Ede F. Mnemonic and attentional roles for states of attenuated alpha oscillations in
690 perceptual working memory: A review. *Eur J Neurosci*. DOI 10.1111/ejn.13759 (2017)
- 691 van Moorselaar D, Foster JJ, Dutterer DW, Theeuwes J, Olivers CNL, Awh E. Spatially selective
692 alpha oscillations reveal moment-by-moment trade-offs between working memory and
693 attention. *J Cogn Neurosci* 30:256-266 (2018)
- 694 Vogel EK, McCollough AW, Machizawa MG. Neural measures reveal individual differences in
695 controlling access to working memory. *Nature* 438:500-503 (2005)
- 696 Williams M, Hong SW, Kang M-S, Carlisle NB, Woodman GF. The benefit of forgetting.
697 *Psychon Bull Rev* 20:348-355 (2013)
- 698 Williams M, Woodman GF. Directed forgetting and directed remembering in visual working
699 memory. *J Exp Psychol Learn Mem Cogn* 38:1206-1220 (2012)
- 700 Wolff MJ, Jochim J, Akyürek EG, Stokes MG. Dynamic hidden states underlying working-
701 memory-guided behavior. *Nat Neurosci* 20:864-871 (2017).
- 702
- 703

Figure Captions

704
705
706
707
708
709
710
711
712
713
714
715
716
717
718
719
720

Figure 1. Spatial Memory Task. Participants encoded the locations of two colored discs (red and blue; sample display). Each disc was presented at one of nine equally spaced locations along the perimeter of an imaginary circle centered at fixation (see Methods and Figure 3). During valid-early trials (VE), the color of the fixation point changed from black to either blue or red immediately after termination of the sample display. This cue indicated which disc would be probed with 100% reliability. During neutral trials, the color of the fixation point changed from black to purple, instructing participants to remember the locations of both discs. During valid-late (VL) trials, the color of the fixation point changed from black to purple. Halfway through the subsequent delay period, the fixation point changed colors from purple to either blue or red. This second change indicated which disc would be probed with 100% reliability. Each trial concluded with a probe display containing a red or blue fixation point, a question mark, and a mouse cursor. Participants were instructed to report the precise location of the disc indicated by the color of the fixation point via mouse click. Note: the above schematic is included for illustrative purposes; displays are not drawn to scale. See *Methods* for display and stimulus geometry.

721
722
723
724
725

Figure 2. Behavioral Performance. Recall error (i.e., the absolute polar angle between the location reported by the participant and the location of the probed disc) was reliably lower during VE relative to Neutral and VL trials. Recall error was also reliably lower during VL relative to Neutral trials. Error bars show 95% confidence intervals.

726
727
728
729
730
731
732
733
734
735
736
737
738
739

Figure 3. Computing time-resolved reconstructions of stimulus location. (A) Location reconstructions for each of the 9 possible stimulus locations from 40° - 360° . The dashed horizontal line in each plot shows the polar location of the stimulus, while the vertical dashed lines at time 0, 500, and 1750 mark the start of the sample epoch, first delay period, and second delay period, respectively (time axis is identical to that shown in Panels B and C). The inset to the left shows each of the nine possible disc locations on each trial. Reconstructions have been pooled and averaged across stimulus identity (i.e., red vs. blue disc) and cue condition (VE, VL, neutral). (B) We circularly shifted the reconstructions shown in (A) to a common center (0°) and averaged them, yielding a single time-resolved location reconstruction. Response scale is identical to that shown in (A). (C) We converted the reconstructions shown in (B) to polar form and projected them onto a vector with angle 0° . We interpreted the resultant vector length as a measure of total location-specific information. Shaded regions represent the 95% within-participant confidence interval. a.u., arbitrary units.

740
741
742
743
744
745
746
747
748
749

Figure 4. Stimulus Reconstructions and Location Information during Encoding. Participants encoded the locations of two colored discs for subsequent report (see Figure 1). (A) Channel response functions were identical across cue conditions. This is unsurprising, as participants had no way of knowing what type of cue they would receive until termination of the encoding display. (B) Robust location information emerged approximately 100 ms after display onset and increased rapidly before reaching an asymptotic limit approximately 350 ms after display onset. Statistically, estimates of location information were identical across cue conditions. Thus, we can be certain that differences in location information during the subsequent WM period are not due to differences that emerge during encoding. Solid lines at the top of panel B mark epochs where estimates of location information were reliably greater than 0.

750 Shaded regions depict the 95% within-participant confidence interval of the mean. a.u., arbitrary
 751 units.

752
 753 **Figure 5. Degradation of Spatial WM Representations During Neutral Trials.** (A) During
 754 neutral trials we observed a monotonic decrease in total location information during the delay
 755 period. Data have been pooled and averaged across stimulus locations (i.e., the locations of the
 756 blue and red discs) and are time-locked to the offset of the sample display (0 ms). The pink bar at
 757 the top of the plot marks epochs where estimates of location information were reliably greater
 758 than zero (false-discovery-rate-corrected cluster-based permutation test, see Methods). (B) We
 759 identified source(s) of information loss by computing and quantifying time-averaged location-
 760 specific reconstructions during the first and second delay periods (see *Quantifying Sources of*
 761 *Information Loss and Recovery*, Methods). (C) Reconstruction amplitudes were reliably lower
 762 during the second relative to the first delay period, suggesting that information loss reflects a
 763 gradual reduction in the overall strength of each spatial WM representation. For all plots shaded
 764 regions and error bars show 95% within-participant confidence intervals. a.u., arbitrary units.

765
 766 **Figure 6. Information Loss is Prevented by a Retrospective Cue Presented Immediately**
 767 **After Encoding.** During VE trials, a 100% reliable retrospective cue indicated which disc (blue
 768 or red) participants would be asked to report. During these trials we observed a rapid decrease in
 769 location information for the uncued disc (black line), but no change in location information for
 770 the cued disc (green line). Green and black bars at the top of the plot mark epochs where location
 771 information was reliably greater than 0 for the cued and uncued discs, respectively. Red bars
 772 mark epochs where location information was reliably larger for the cued relative to the uncued
 773 disc. Shaded regions depict 95% within-participant confidence intervals. a.u., arbitrary units.

774
 775 **Figure 7. Recovery of Location Information Following a Delayed Retrospective Cue.** During
 776 VL trials, a neutral cue was replaced by a valid cue midway through the delay period. (A) We
 777 observed a monotonic decrease in location information during the neutral portion of the trial,
 778 followed by a partial recovery of location information for the cued disc during the valid portion
 779 of the trial. Pink, green, and black lines at the top of the plot mark epochs where estimates of
 780 location information were reliably greater than 0, while red lines mark epochs where estimates of
 781 location information were reliably greater for the cued relative to the uncued disc. (B) To
 782 quantify changes in location information after retrocue onset we divided the second delay period
 783 into separate early and late epochs (1251-1700 ms and 2050-2500 ms after sample offset,
 784 respectively) and computed the average location information for each disc across both epochs.
 785 Location information was significantly greater for the cued disc during the late relative to the
 786 early epoch, while location information was significantly smaller for the cued disc during the late
 787 relative to the early epoch. (C) We computed and quantified time-averaged reconstructions of the
 788 cued disc's location during the early and late epochs of the second delay period. (D)
 789 Reconstruction amplitudes were reliably larger during the late relative to the early epoch,
 790 consistent with an attention-based enhancement of the cued representation. For all plots shaded
 791 regions and error bars depict 95% within-participant confidence intervals.

792
 793 **Figure 8. Location-specific Reconstructions cannot be Explained by Subtle Biases in Eye**
 794 **Position.** Our analyses focused on VE trials as this is where systematic biases in eye position
 795 should be most apparent (i.e., because participants were only required to remember one

796 location). (A) Circular histograms showing angular estimates of eye position are plotted as a
797 function of stimulus location. Each histogram corresponds to one of the 9 possible stimulus
798 locations (see Figure 3A). Data are scaled according to the schematic in the center of the plot.
799 (B) Regression coefficients describing the relationship between horizontal EOG voltage (hEOG;
800 μV) and remembered stimulus locations. Vertical dashed lines at 0 and 500 ms mark the onset
801 and offset of the sample display, while the dashed line during at 1750 ms represents the mid-
802 point of the delay period. Shaded regions are 95% within-participant confidence intervals.

803

804 **Figure 9. Synopsis of Key Findings.** Red, blue, and black lines are reproduced from Figure 5A,
805 Figure 6, and Figure 7A, respectively.

806

807

















